

**CITY OF SAINT PAUL
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: The Dickerman House, 1440 Summit Avenue

DATE OF APPLICATION: January 29, 2015

APPLICANT: Mike Killa, Authentic Construction Company

OWNERS: Tom and Claudia Clark

DATE OF HEARING: February 26, 2015

HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District

CATEGORY: Contributing

CLASSIFICATION: Building Permit

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Christine Boulware, John Beaty

DATE: February 17, 2015 update March 18, 2015

- A. SITE DESCRIPTION:** Built in 1914, this two story Tudor Revival style house has a wood shake side gabled roof, with a central shed roof dormer. The first story exterior walls are rough brown brick Flemish bond walls while stucco, false timbering, and decorative barge boards adorn the second story. A gabled ell with an exterior end brick chimney projecting from the left (east) elevation makes the façade asymmetrical. The timber bracketed, gabled front porch is full width, except for the ell, with a capped brick knee wall, and a false-timbered pediment over the entry pavilion. The three-center entry arch has a stone Gibbs surround and a paneled, one-quarter glazed wood door. To the left of the entry are a set of four, eight-over-eight windows, and the right side has a square window between two arrow slit windows. Fenestration on the first story contains stone sills. The second story windows are eight-over-eight double-hungs and eight-light awnings trimmed with false-timbering. The dormer has paired casement windows and coursed wood shakes on the sides and front. The house and garage are categorized as contributing to the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District.
- B. PROPOSED CHANGES:** The applicant proposes to remove the two existing layers of wood shingles/shakes on the house roof and replace them with an architectural asphalt shingle; GAF Timberline HD, Barkwood color. As part of the re-roof, the wood shingles/shakes on the dormer walls are proposed to be removed and replaced with fiber-cement “shake” boards.
- C. BACKGROUND:** The owner recently purchased the property. In 2014, staff administratively approved the enclosing of a rear porch as part of a larger remodel of adjacent kitchen and living spaces. In a meeting with staff, Mr. Clark indicated that the wood shingles/shakes on the roof were installed in the 1970s. Staff is also currently reviewing an application for the installation of air conditioning.

On March 18, the applicant removed a section of wood shakes from the garage to expose the historic wood shingles underneath. These shingles appear to have been dipped in creosote or stained/tinted dark brown. They are uniformly cut with square corners and smoothly finished. Photos are included in the packet and measurement details have been included in a table.

D. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:

Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation

- (1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- (3) Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
- (4) Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
- (5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- (6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- (7) Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- (8) Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

(36 CFR, § 67.7)

Summit Avenue West District Guidelines

Sec. 74.36. Restoration and rehabilitation.

(a) General Principles:

- (1) All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal or alteration of distinctive architectural features should be avoided.
- (2) Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design, color, texture and appearance. Duplication of original design based on physical or pictorial evidence is preferable to using conjectural or "period" designs or using parts of other buildings.
- (3) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship characteristic of structures of a period should be treated sensitively.

(4) Buildings should be used for their originally intended purpose or compatible uses which require minimum alteration of the building and its site.

(5) In general, buildings should be restored to their original appearance. However, alterations to buildings since their construction are sometimes significant because they reflect the history of the building and neighborhood. This significance should be respected and restoration to an "original" appearance may not be desirable in some cases. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time and not be altered to resemble buildings from an earlier era.

(6) Whenever possible, new additions or alterations to structures should be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.

(b) *Walls and Foundations:*

(1) Deteriorated surface materials should be replaced with material used in original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Imitative materials, such as artificial stone and artificial brick veneer, should not be used.

(c) *Roofs and Chimneys:*

(1) Original roofing materials should be retained unless deteriorated. When partially reroofing, deteriorated roof coverings should be replaced with new materials that match the old in composition, size, shape and texture. When entirely reroofing, new materials which differ to such an extent from the old in composition, size, shape, color or texture that the appearance of the buildings is altered should not be used. The predominant roof materials on west Summit are tile and asphalt shingles. Tile roofs are either red or green, generally to complement rather than match the color of the house. When asphalt shingles began to be used in the 1890s and early twentieth century, the most common colors were solid, uniform, deep red and solid, uniform, dark green. Dark brown, dark gray, and a weathered-wood color may also be acceptable for new asphalt shingles, and black may be acceptable for Colonial Revival houses built after the 1920s.

(e) *Exterior Architectural Features:*

(2) Decorative architectural features such as cornices, brackets, railings and those around front doors and windows should be preserved. New material used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated architectural features of wood, iron, cast iron, terra-cotta, tile and brick should match the original as closely as possible.

Sec. 74.37. New construction.

(d) *Building Elements*

(1) *Roofs*

Roof hardware such as skylights, vents and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.

E. FINDINGS:

1. On March 1, 1990, the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No. 17716. The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).
2. The Dickerman House and garage at 1440 Summit Avenue are categorized as contributing to the character of the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District.

3. The original building permit and the 1903-1925 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map identify wood shingles/shakes as the original roofing material at 1440 Summit Avenue. The wood shingle/shake roof and dormer walls are distinctive features of the property. The current roof was installed in the 1970s and the age and condition of the wood shingle/shake indicate replacement is necessary.
4. On March 18, the owner submitted measurements and photos of the bottom layer of wood shingles on the garage.
- 4-5. §74.36(a)(2) The replacement of the existing wood shingle/shake roof with ~~an~~ the CertainTeed Independence asphalt shingle ~~does not comply~~ complies with the principle, as the proposed asphalt shingles ~~do not have similar dimensions and shape to closely match the original wood shingle/shake in composition, design, color, texture and appearance.~~ The proposed asphalt shingles ~~may be have a slightly thinner profile, smaller is similar in size, and matches the (exposure).~~ do not have the same profile/thickness, and have a different texture and appearance are not the same, but with a regular pattern and less variation in widths the product could be an appropriate replacement. (See attachments)
- 5 6. §74.36(c)(1) The replacement of the existing wood shake roof with ~~an asphalt shingle does not the~~ CertainTeed Independence asphalt shingle complies with the guideline, as these asphalt shingles will do not differ to such an extent that that the appearance of the building [will be] significantly altered. The loss in profile and depth of material along the eaves, at the wood ridges and metal valleys will not have an adverse impact on the visual and historical integrity of the building, as the existing roofing is actually two layers of wood shingles which creates a more pronounced profile where edges are exposed, this is not the historic condition. Additionally, the similarity of the size and profile of shingles between the roof plane and dormer walls will be lost slightly altered, resulting in only a minor visual impact.
- 6 7. §74.36(b)(1) The replacement of the existing wood shingle/shake dormer walls with fiber-cement shake siding will result in the loss of historically accurate material, ~~but the~~ The proposed HardieShingle® Siding Straight Edge Shake does not comply ~~es~~ with guideline as it does not resemble[s] the appearance of the old shingles shakes and so long as it is installed to match the pattern and exposure of the existing wood and painted or stained to match an aged wood shingle/shake it will not have an adverse impact on the property. Wood shingles matching the historic wood shingles in size, profile, pattern, and exposure would comply with the guideline.
- 7 8. §74.36(e)(2) Alterations and/or repairs of the fascia, soffits, gutters or downspouts were not included as part of this application, but would require an application be submitted should any work be required.
- 8 9. §74.37(d)(1) The roofing specifications in the application lists that replacement of existing roof vents, valley metals, and pipe jacks shall be in the color closest to the selected shingles and that kitchen and bath vents will be black. Vents and pipes should be located on the rear roof plane as much as possible and be should be as low profile as code will allow. Flashing at the chimney should be step-flashing into mortar joints in order to avoid damaging brick.
- 9 10. The proposal to replace the wood shingle roof and dormer walls of the Dickerman House at 1440 Summit Avenue will have an adverse impact on the property and Program for Preservation and architectural control of the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)).

F. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the findings, staff recommends approval of the building permit application to replace the shingles/shakes on the dormers with the following conditions:

1. The dormer siding ~~may~~ shall be replaced with wood shingles to match the historic wood shingle in size and profile. ~~shakes or the HardieShingle® Siding Straight Edge Shake.~~
2. The dormer siding material shall be painted or stained a dark color to blend with the colors of the early wood roof on the house.
3. The material shall be installed to match the pattern, coursing, and exposure of the existing wood shingle/~~shake~~ siding.
4. All final materials, colors and details shall be submitted to the HPC and/or staff for final review and approval.
5. Any revisions to the approved plans shall be reviewed and approved by the HPC and/or staff.
6. The roofing material may be an in-kind replacement of the historic wood shingles still extant. CertainTeed Independence asphalt shingles in a dark brown color would also be a suitable replacement product.
7. Vents and pipes should be located on the rear roof plane as much as possible and have a dark finish to match the roofing material.
8. Flashing at masonry surfaces/chimneys shall be step-flashing into mortar joints only. No reglet shall be cut into brick.

~~Further, based on the findings, staff recommends denial of the application to replace the wood shingle/shake roof with asphalt shingles.~~

~~Staff could review and administratively approved in-kind replacement of the wood shingle/shake roof or replacement with a synthetic wood product that matches the size, pattern, profile, and color of the current roofing material.~~

G. ATTACHMENTS:

1. HPC Application
2. Photographs
3. Material Details and Specifications
4. Correspondence
5. Roofing Material Comparison Table
6. Photos by owner – 3-18-15

ROOFING MATERIAL COMPARISON TABLE

Product	Thickness	Widths	Exposure	Shape
GAF Timberline*	1/8 to 3/8"	4-1/2 to 5-5/8"	5-5/8"	Trapezoidal
CertainTeed Independence*	1/8 to 1/4"	3 to 8-1/8"	5"	Rectangular
GAF Slateline*	1/8"	7-5/8"	7-1/2"	Trapezoidal
Hardie†	3/16"	4-1/8 to 9-7/8"	5" or 7"	Rectangular
Historic Shingles‡	1/4 to 3/8"	3 to 6"	5"	Rectangular

* tar and gravel surface

† applied flat sawn / plank sawn surface texture

‡ examples are sawn and rough-sawn (not split).







