

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard
October 4, 2012

Present: Richard Dana, Robert Ferguson, Michael Justin, Richard Laffin, John Manning, Matt Mazanec, David Reihle, Steve Trimble

Absent: Matt Hill (excused), Renee Hutter (not excused), Diane Trout-Oertel (not excused), David Wagner (excused)

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Boulware, Bill Dermody

Business Meeting

- I. **Call to order: 5:04**, Vice Chair Dana called the meeting to order.
- II. **Approval of the Agenda:** Staff added an item to New Business to memorialize the Great River Passage Plan. Commissioner Riehle moved to approve the agenda as amended. Commissioner Justin seconded the motion. **The motion passed unanimously.**
- III. **Conflicts of Interest** – There were none stated.
- IV. **Approval of the Meeting Minutes:** Commissioner Dana submitted minor edits to staff. Commissioner Ferguson moved to approve the August minutes with the edits; Commissioner Riehle seconded the motion. **The motion passed unanimously.**
 - A. August 9, 2012 Business Meeting
 - B. August 23, 2012 Public Hearing
 - C. ~~September 20, 2012 Joint Business Meeting/Public Hearing~~
- V. **Chair's Announcements** – The Chair did not have any announcements.
- VI. **Staff Announcements** – Staff introduced Bill Dermody, a new planner in PED, who will help with writing staff reports when needed. Mr. Dermody briefly introduced himself to the commission.
- VII. **Public Hearing/Permit Review**
 - A. **385 Portland Avenue, Hill Historic District**, by Becker Building and Remodeling LLC, for a building permit to construct a new dormer and add a balcony and door to an existing dormer on the east elevation. File #13-001 (Amy Spong, 266-6714). Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Commissioner Manning asked if work had proceeded without a permit or approval. Staff indicated that exterior alterations were not carried out except the skylights and the HPC approval had expired. Commissioner Dana asked if staff had worked with the applicant. Staff replied they had met with the applicant and architect in August and gave some history of the review and the involvement of consultant Paul Larson. Commissioner Ferguson stated that he didn't understand the added condition and asked staff to establish context. Staff replied that it was to install an arch-top door with a muntin in the original plane of the storm window and paint it. Commissioner Manning asked when the stone sill was removed. Staff replied it was removed in 2005 when the roof was repaired.

Robert Paulson and Cary Becker were present to discuss the proposal. Mr. Paulson stated that the door was there in 2006 and the work had started and stopped. He added

that they could make an archtop door and install a storm or screen door in the original plane. They will do whatever it takes to get approval. He informed the commission that the shed dormer used to be servants quarters and is now a kitchen that is not very visible. He added that they will put slate on the dormer.

Mr. Becker stated that he has been involved with this project since the summer and can follow the conditions.

Staff asked if a storm door would be able to open. Mr. Becker replied, maybe.

Commissioner Dana asked what the material would be for the door. Mr. Becker replied it would be wood, arched with a middle rail and both glass and screen.

Commissioner Laffin asked for clarification of some measurements regarding the door and a header. Mr. Becker stated that a header could be integral into the rafters to allow for clearance.

Mr. Becker introduced a new rendering from the architect. Commissioner asked about the purpose of the 4th floor balcony. Mr. Paulson replied that the owner wants it for light, to sit outside and look outside.

Commissioner Dana asked if there were any issues raised that could not be accommodated. Mr. Becker replied there were not.

There was no testimony and the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Trimble asked if the owner was okay with the conditions. Mr. Paulson stated he wants to get it done right.

Commissioner Trimble asked if moving the door or a screen door were an option. Staff stated it should be clarified as part of the motion. Commissioner Manning replied that both are options.

Commissioner Manning moved to approve the staff recommendation with findings adding a condition to move the door to the original plane or install an appropriate storm door at the original plane and to work with staff. Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion. Commissioner Ferguson stated the need to know the dimensions of the plane of the door. Commissioner Dana advised not to alter the roof below. **The motion passed 7-0.**

VIII. Historic Resource Review

A. 877 Wilson Avenue, *Historic Resource Review* on a nuisance property declared by the Department of Safety and Inspections, Division of Code Enforcement. The property is a Vacant Building Category 3 and has been issued an order to abate. State Inventory #RA-SPC-1120. (Boulware, 266-6715).

Staff read the report recommending that demolition be delayed in order for alternatives to be explored. Staff also recommended that a qualified historian be hired to evaluate National Register and local eligibility of both the building and its contribution to the Dayton's Bluff Historic District and neighborhood.

Commissioner Trimble noted that Wilson was not a streetcar route and the resolution should be amended to remove the streetcar notation.

Commissioner Dana moved to adopt the findings and recommendation and support the resolution as amended. Commissioner Mazanec seconded the motion. The motion passed 8 to 0.

Commissioner Dana stated that it is important that we don't dismiss historic structures as not being relevant. Just because there is a lot of work to be done doesn't mean we should write it off. A vacant lot would be more blight to the neighborhood.

Commissioner Mazanec stated it is significant to retain the storefront/commercial buildings in the context of the Dayton's Bluff neighborhood.

IX. New Business

A. District Del Sol Master Plan, by the Department of Planning and Economic Development, to adopt a resolution with recommendations for the Planning Commission and City Council. File #12-DDSMP. (Spong, 266-6714) -- Staff summarized the staff memo and presented a draft resolution for discussion. Commissioner Ferguson provided comments regarding a meeting with Karen Reid and staff making edits on the plan prior to this HPC review. He further commented that only one recommendation was made to work on a new sentence that addresses the span of settlement pattern and cultural groups over time and generally, the plan has a strong pro-preservation message. Commissioner Dana questioned why the HPC was not listed as a partner on page 38 for more of the preservation-related strategies and if being involved in more educational strategies was realistic. Commissioner Laffin noted the aerial view on the main page is not oriented north. He also stated that in the Implementation section, it would be smart to identify who the different parties are and what their roles are. Commissioner Ferguson explained WSCO, REDA and the Bluff Task Force and their roles in this Plan. Commissioner Laffin noted that some comments could be brought informally to staff rather than including them in the formal resolution. One informal comment is the lack of captions for the photos.

Commissioner Manning commented on the implementation schedule with respect to survey work and prioritizing this in the short-term. Staff stated that it is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan but that the HPC doesn't have short terms plans to survey this area. Commissioner Ferguson stated that language on prioritizing and partnering for a complete West Side survey will be coming in the West Side Plan. He stated it's appropriate for the HPC to partner with WSCO and staff also envisions a partnership rather than taking on as a lead. Commissioner Manning stated there should be future discussion on priorities citywide given that several neighborhood plans now recommend new survey work.

Commissioner Trimble noted five items, 1) on page 22 that Public Art St. Paul should be an implementer in public art installations and maintenance, 2) questioned if the HPC had ever designated a mural and staff answered no but that Chapter 73 allows for designation of sites, objects, landscapes and districts. Also, in the new Lowertown Design Guidelines it is anticipated there will be protection measures for old "ghost" signs that were painted on warehouse walls, 3) page 23 1.4 should address the old immigrant experience and culture before Latino's came in the 1920's. Commissioner Ferguson clarified that a broad statement will be written but it doesn't necessarily belong in this small area plan but should be broadened in the West Side Plan. To only mention Jewish and Lebanese is exclusionary and all immigrant communities should be identified and who "migrated" from the flats as well. Item number 4) is in response to page 23, 2.3 where audio tapes should be recorded of early Latino residents who are still alive and finally item 5) is that only a couple buildings appear to be eligible for historic designation but more research should be done to identify home of famous people on the West Side. Commissioner Ferguson responded that would be a strategy for the West Side Plan and not this small area plan.

Commissioner Dana moved to adopt the draft resolution with a clarification under the one recommendation to replace a sentence with one that better responds to the broader array of immigrant communities and make a distinction from the flats. Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion and it unanimously passed 8 to 0.

B. Great River Passage Plan, by Saint Paul Department of Parks and Recreation, to adopt a resolution with recommendations for the City Council. File #12-GRPP (Spong, 266-6714) -- Staff presented a final draft resolution for consideration and the resolution

was memorialized with no edits.

X. Committee Reports

- A.** Education Committee (Ferguson, Manning, Trout-Oertel) – Commissioner Ferguson informed the commission that the Education Committee hasn't met, but is exchanging emails.
- B.** 3M Advisory Committee/Workgroups update (Trimble) – Commissioner Trimble informed the commission that only one historic building remains at the site.

XI. Adjourn: 7:05 p.m.

Submitted by: C. Boulware & A. Spong